

VOL. 3 NO. 2 DEC., 2017



ISSN - 2536-7358

IJAD

ILORIN JOURNAL OF ADMINISTRATION AND DEVELOPMENT



**JOURNAL OF THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
UNIVERSITY OF ILORIN, NIGERIA.**

Contents

Editorial Board	ii
Instructions to Contributors	iii
Editorial Comments	iv - v
Contents	vi - vii.
 Abuse of Local Governments by State Governors in Nigeria and the Challenges on Democratization Aliyu, M. Kolawole, PhD	 1 - 13
 Elections and Electoral Violence in the Nigeria's Fourth Republic Kelly Omosat OSIFO and Nicholas Idris ERAMEH	 14 - 25
 An Impact Evaluation of Skills Acquisition Programs on Women Empowerment in Giwa Local Government Area of Kaduna State Umar, Abubakar Yaru, Oyedele, Samuel Olanrewaju Nelson Gabriel, Abdulkareem Abdulrazaq Kayode and Ishola, Abdulrasaq Ajadi	 26 - 40
 Legitimacy of Democratic Governance in the Nigeria's Fourth Republic AZEEZ, Adenrele Lukman and OYEWO, Oyekunle Oluseye	 41 - 48
 Administrative Reforms in the Nigerian Civil Service: A Re-Examination Igbokwe Philomena Ify (Ph.D.)	 49 - 56
 The Interactive effect of wages and salaries administration on workers' Performance in Nigeria I. T. Akindele (PhD), R. I. Akindele (PhD) and A. K. Abdulkareem	 57 - 66
 State-Local Relations in Nigeria and its implication on public Service Delivery at the Local Government Level VAMBE, JEREMIAH TERSUR (Ph.D.)	 67 - 80
 Factors Influencing Information and Communications Technology (ICT) Adoption and Utilization in Selected Audit Firms in Southwestern Nigeria. EFUNWOLE M.S., OLUWATOPE A.O., OGUNJEMILUA E.M. and BINUYO G.O.	 81 - 91

- Comparing The Politics of Revenue Allocation in Nigeria
and Ethiopia: Trends And Challenges
**Nuruddeen Muhammad Koko and
Bayero Bukkuyum Kasim (Ph.D.)** 92 - 103
- Cross-carpeting, Party Alignment and the Challenges of
Democratic Consolidation in Nigeria
**Omodunbi Olumide Olumuyiwa,
Ogah Godfrey Oche and
Owasanoye Oyepeju. I** 104 - 113
- Health Care Financing for Victims of Child Trafficking in
Nigeria: Trends and Analysis of the cost of Medical
Treatment Per Victim Per Year
**Saka, M. J.
Oloriegbe, I. Y,
Saka, A. O. and
Salman A.** 114 - 123
- A study of Independent National Electoral Commission
(INEC) and the Challenges of Conducting Elections in
Nigeria
**(Barr.) Ishaq Isola OMOLEKE (Ph.D)
BENSON, Kunle Shinde (Ph.D) and
NOFIU, Oluwasesan Akanni (Ph.D)** 124 - 134
- Inter-Tier Power Relations in Kwara State: An Overview
of its relations with Ilorin West, Moro and Oyun Local
Governments
**Abdullahi Alabi
Professors Abdulrauf Ambali and
Abdullateef Ameen** 135 - 149

Inter-Tier Power Relations in Kwara State: An Overview of its relations with Ilorin West, Moro and Oyun Local Governments

By

Abdullahi Alabi

Politics and Governance Department, Kwara State University, Malete;
alabi.abdullahi@kwasu.edu.ng

Professors Abdulrauf Ambali

Politics and Governance Department, Kwara State University, Malete
abdulrauf.ambali@kwasu.edu.ng

&

Abdullateef Ameen

Public Administration Department, University of Ilorin, Kwara State
abdlateef4ever@gmail.com

Abstract

Local government is the third tiers of governments that are saddled with responsibility to cater for the inhabitants of the grass root and to promote this, the constitution recognizes the inter-tier relations among the organs of governments but yet the poor performances of the local government still persist. To achieve quality service delivery, this study examined the relationship between the state and the local governments on healthcare series delivery. This study realized that the power relation affects the local performance as a result of inability of the constitution to state clearly the political power of the local governments to act as independent organization. The study adopted qualitative and quantitative methods of analyzing the data collected in respect of the power relations between Kwara state and local governments on health services delivery. The study recommended that the autonomy should be given to the local governments to act independently

Keywords: *Inter-tier Relations, Power Relations, Inter-governmental Relations, Local Government, Kwara State*

Introduction

Nigeria, like many other nations around the world, operates a federal system, from where disputes may often arise between different levels of government on the basis of service provision or infrastructure, constitutional jurisdiction, fiscal arrangements such as vertical fiscal imbalance or spending powers or environmental or social issues. To cater for these issues, most federations like Nigeria, Australia, Canada, and USA have developed systems of inter-relationship consultation and cooperation to deal with such issues, and to manage and foster cooperation between governments. The character of these inter-relationships is often unique to each federation, and depends on various factors such as history, geography, population, size and other formal federal arrangements. Inter-tier processes and arrangements are common features of federations around the world; the form of such arrangements varies depending on the specific circumstances of each federation (Business comment of Australia, 2006).

Thus, the Nigerian government and administration is structured in a manner that the various ethnic groupings and nationalities are represented in the processes of policy formulation and execution. The evolution of federalism in Nigeria derives from economic,

political/constitutional, social and cultural developments, which have influenced the nature and character of inter-governmental (power) relations (Ekpo, 2004). However, Nigeria's model of federalism for instance, represents a fundamental legal and institutional frame-work of policy making in the country. As in other federations, it defines the core rules of resource allocation, distribution of responsibilities for service delivery, and mechanisms for interaction between different tiers of government. Nigeria's federalism arrangements are currently attracting increasing attention from both policy makers and analysts. This is a reflection of the fact that longer attentions from the short and long time perspectives of economic policy reform in the country are critically dependent upon improvements in the organization of inter-tier arrangements. Lev (2008) considered the power relations between the state and local governments with the concept of the inter-tier relations in Nigeria, which has many goals to achieve and these goals are to:

- i. promote peace and harmony among the tiers of government;
- ii. put in-place a mechanism for the achievement of self-reliant economy;
- iii. promote natural economic integration among the levels of government;
- iv. generate co-operation rather than competitive federation; and
- v. stop the issue of rural-urban migration and poverty.

Consequently, an Inter-tier relation is an inevitable phenomenon in a federal system or non-federating systems. As long as the Nigerian federation continues to survive, resources sharing adjustments will continue to feature as an important fiscal arrangement in the federation this will continue to play a vital role in the operation and structural interplay of the federation. Too much concentration of political and economic power at one level has ultimately and inevitably leads to managerial expansion. However, the power relations between state and local governments have drastically affected the local governments in which their achievements were far behind satisfactory level of public interest (Dalhatu, 2006)

Problem Statement

It is obvious that local governments exist with the belief to cater for the need of the people at the grassroots but yet the expectation of the populace towards the activities of local governments since its establishment is yet to be released. Some literatures showed that scholars have engaged in many ways to explicate the factors that embedded the performance of the local governments, but the problem here is that many local governments are still facing the problems which are yet to be covered.

Research Question

Specifically, the study attempts to ask the following research question:

- (a) To what extent does state-local governments' power relation affect health care services delivery in the local government areas of Kwara State?

Research Objective

This study sets forth to address this objective:

- (a) The study examines the state-local governments' power relations and its effect on health care services delivery in the local communities of the State.

1.4 Significance of the Study

This study will be a resource material for public policy practitioners, academics, students and researchers.

1.5 Scope of the Study

The study is aimed at assessing the impact of state-local government councils' power relations on the healthcare services delivery, efforts are on some selected local governments, cut across the three senatorial districts, such as North (Moro), Central (Ilorin West) and South (Oyun) in Kwara state between 2014 to 2017.

Conceptual Clarification

Power Relations

Power relations as a concept means a relation between people and it's expressed in simple symbolic notation (Robert, 2016). Robert further classified the following as the properties of power relations:

A necessary condition for power relation is that there exists a time lag, however small, from actions of the actor who is said to exert power to the responses of the respondent. Whenever the president announces a new policy, the agents immediately secure the compliance of the top officials. This point is what the local governments in Nigeria are experience as far as their relationships with the states, the state influenced the local governments' policies by announce new policies that can only promote the interest of the state. A second necessary condition is, like the first, obvious and nonetheless important in research: there is no 'action at a distance.' unless there is some 'connection' between two entities, then no power relation can be said to exist. In looking for a flow of influence, control, or power from one entity to another, there is need to find out whether there is connection, or an opportunity for a connection. A cursory look at this condition could be traced to the connection between state and local governments mostly in Nigeria. In examining the intuitive view of the power relation, it suggested that it seemed to involve a successful attempt by one level of government to get another level of governments do something he would not otherwise do. This hints at a way of stating a third necessary condition for the power relation. Here is a situation whereby the state government takes the total responsibility of the local governments as a result of power relations that exist between them. In the area of revenue collection such as internally revenue generation (IGR), payment of local government staff, renovation and construction of local governments' schools, hospitals and roads.

2.2 Inter-Tier Relations

Inter-tier relations are the responses that have been developed to facilitate cooperative policy making among divided governments within a federal system. Inter-tier relations are supposed to play a 'bridge-building' role to bring a degree of coordination and cooperation to divide powers (Business comment of Australia, 2006). Adamolekun (1983) considered inter-tier relations as an interaction that established among the different levels of government within a country. Considering this postulation, the inter-tier relations are the mechanisms that supposed to be a linkage pipe that will link the tiers of government together for the benefit and well-functioning of the system. Inyang&Bassey (2014) opined that an inter-tier relation is the term commonly used to describe the interactions between the different levels of government within a state. To him, the word 'level' implies a juxtaposition of higher and lower levels.

Lev (2008), explains that Nigerian constitution provides for the participation of all three tiers of government in the delivery of core public services, such as education and health. This makes policy coordination an important pre-condition for effective and efficient service delivery. Several factors can be adduced as justification for building workable inter-tiers

coordination mechanisms. As further illustrated by Lev:

In the environment of shared responsibility for service delivery, non-coordinated interventions of different government levels create a risk for duplication of efforts and sub-optimal allocation of resources. It is sensible for all government levels to align their actions with such priorities and thus complement each effort. This is because, as in common complex social systems, there is significant potential for synergies between coordinated policies and actions. Finally, coordination could lead to better overall resources utilization through economy of scale, quicker project completion, and more efficient use of limited resources (such as specialized technical expertise), this will facilitate dissemination of best management practices. However, the issue of inter-tier policy coordination has become increasingly important in Nigeria in recent times. This is primarily because since 1999 the Nigerian fiscal system has gone through rapid decentralization.

Erunke (2016), state-local governments' relations involves both vertical and horizontal relationships that exist between the various organs and departments within the sovereign government of a particular country. However, Akinsanya (2005) classified inter-tier relations into six namely:

1. Federal-state relations: - this is a relationship or interaction between the federal and state governments in terms of policy implementations, the best example of this, is the concurrent legislative list which recognized by the constitution.
2. Federal-state-local relations: - this occurs in a country like Nigeria where the federal governments relate with the local government through the political channel of the state government. It becomes unusual for the federal government to directly relate to the local government without passing through the channel of the state government.
3. Federal-local relations: - this relationship is not common in every federal political system. It could be referred to as an interaction between the federal government and the local government. It occurs when local government faces natural disasters which are beyond the capacity of the state and local government to normalize. the example is this federal government intervention in Kwara state on flood disaster that motivated the federal government to allocate fund through the state government, also the area where the Federal Government and the state connected is on the issue of Local Government education that has to do with subvention from federal government to ensure adequate education at the lower level known as grass root.
4. State-state (interstate) relations: - this occurs between a state and another. It is enhanced occasionally possible when two states belong to a political party. The major aim of this relationship is to jointly pool resources together to achieve developmental goals.
5. State-local relations:- this is a kind of relationship that occurred among the state and local governments, this is the most critical level of relationship in the configuration of the country, a lots of issue here affecting the autonomy of local governments, such as Joint Allocation, Appointment, Internally Generated Revenue (IGR), Party politics and Constitutional role.

Methodology

The method adopted by this study is quantitative and qualitative methods. It is designed to analyze the outcome of questionnaire and interview conducted from the selected

local governments of Kwara State.

Unit of Analysis

Since this study involves people, the unit of analysis is the individual employee of some cottage hospitals, the clients, Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy Affairs, Ex-local Government Councilors and Chairmen, Local Government Service Commission, Civil Society Organization and Local Government staff member be focused on the selected personnel of health division under the local governments (Ilorin West, Oyun and Moro). The division or specific sectors are not mentioned in this study due to the strict request from the director for anonymity.

Sample Size

The sample size of the respondents (n) for the purpose of this study is approximately 250, which comprise nearly some personnel of the organizations involved, such as Local Government Councils, Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy affairs, community Healthcare Centres and some Civil Societies from the three selected Local Governments in the regions of Kwara State. According to Isreal's model for determine sample size, which is attached as appendix, for every 100,000 population and above, sample size should be considered. This now serves as justification to picked 250 respondents cut across the three local governments selected for the study.

Table 2: The Target Respondents

S/N	Institutions	Number of Questionnaire Distributed	Job Duty
1.	Ilorin West Local Government	100	Current & Former Chairmen, Admin Officers, Health Officers, and member of Civil Societies
2.	Moro Local Government	75	Current & Former Chairmen, Admin Officers, Health Officers, and member of Civil Societies
3.	Oyun Local Government	75	Current & Former Chairmen, Admin Officers, Health Officers, and member of Civil Societies

Source: from the filed study 2017

Data Presentation and Analysis

This presents the results of the statistical analysis which were carried out in the field. It would basically discuss the sample demographic profile and presents the frequency count and percentage distribution of the respondents. It also preceded to the normality test results. Finally, provides the findings of the study in relation to its respective research objective and hypothesis.

Demographic Profiles of Respondents based on the selected local governments
 Respondents of this study comprise the staff members of local government councils, ministry of local government and chieftaincy affairs and some healthcare centres which cut across the local government areas of the study, NULGE, ALGON, the patients and were the civil society. 250 questionnaires were distributed to the targeted audience, but only 180 were

returned the questionnaire during collection, amount to 72% response rate. The demographic variables of the respondents are namely gender, age, highest education level, job position, years of service.

Analysis and Findings

Gender of the Respondents by the selected local governments in Kwara State

Table 3: Gender of Respondents

Local Government	Male	Female	Total
Ilorin West	41(55.4%)	33(44.6%)	74(100%)
Moro	30(52.6%)	48(47.4%)	57(100%)
Oyun	29(59.2%)	35(40.8%)	49(100%)

The table reflected that out of one hundred and eighty copies returned from the field, seventy four from Ilorin west indicates that 41 represent (55.4% respondents) were male while 33 respondents represent 44.6% were female. While it also reflected that out of fifty seven copies from Moro, where thirty with 52.6% were male while forty eight with 47.4% were female and lastly the forty nine copies from the Oyun, 29 represent (59.2% respondents) were male while 33 respondents represent 44.6% were female.

Age of the Respondents by the Selected Local Governments in Kwara State

Table 4: Age of the Respondents

Local Government	18-39	30-39	40-49	50-59	60-69	Total
Ilorin West	17(23%)	21(28.4)	23(31%)	12(16.2%)	1(1.4)	74(100%)
Moro	24(42%)	22(38.6%)	7(12.3%)	3(5.3%)	1(1.8%)	57(100%)
Oyun	19(38.8%)	15(30.6%)	14(28.6%)	1(2%)	-	49(100%)

The table above showed that out of one hundred and eighty copies returned from the field seventy-four (74) copies from Ilorin west, 23% (17) were between the age 18-29, 28.4% of (21) were between the age of 30-39, 31% (23) were between the age 40-49, 16.2% of (12) were between the age of 50-59 1.4% (1) was between the age 60-69. It also showed that fifty-seven copies (57) returned from the Moro, 42% (24) were between the ages 18-29, 38.6% of (22) were between the ages of 30-39, 12.3% (7) were between the ages 40-49, 5.3% of (3) were between the ages of 50-59 no respondent was between the ages of 60-69. Lastly, the table also indicated that forty nine (49) returned from the Oyun, 38.8% (19) were between the age 18-29, 30.6% of (15) were between the age of 30-39, 28.6% (14) were between the age 40-49, 2.0% of (1) were between the age of 50-59.

Level of Education of the Respondents in the selected Local Governments in Kwara State

Table 5: Level of Education of the Respondents

Local Government	Primary	Secondary	Polytechnic	Post graduate	First degree	Other	Total
Ilorin West	45(60.8%)	22(29.7%)	6(8.1%)	-	1(1.4%)	-	74(100%)
Moro	47(82.4%)	6(10.5%)	2(3.5%)	-	1(1.8%)	1(1.8%)	57(100%)
Oyun	41(83.7%)	5(10.2%)	3(6.1%)	-	-	-	49(100%)

The table above reflected that out of one hundred and eighty (180) copies returned from the field, Ilorin west recorded seventy four copies (74) with 60.8% (45) respondents were primary holders, 29.7% of (22) respondents were the secondary school holders, 8.1% (6) respondents were the polytechnic graduates and 1.4% (1) respondent, were the holder of first degree. The table also reflected that Moro recorded fifty-seven copies with 82.4% (47) respondents were primary holders, 10.5% of (6) respondents were the secondary school holders, 3.5% (2) respondents were the polytechnic graduates and 1.8% (1) respondents, was the holder of first degree and 1.8% (1) respondents did not specified. The table also showed that Oyun recorded fourth- nine (49) copies with 83.7% (41) respondents were primary holders, 10.2% of (5) respondents were the secondary school holders and 6.1% (3) respondents were the polytechnic graduates

Objective

- I. To assess the power relations between the state and the local governments on healthcare service delivery in selected local government areas of Kwara State,
Do you think the Local Government is Given Adequate Autonomy to Recruitment the Healthcare Officers without State Government Interference?

Table 6: Adequate Autonomy to Recruitment

Local Government	Yes	No	Total
Ilorin West	14(18.9%)	60(81.1%)	74(100%)
Moro	9(15.8%)	48(84.2%)	57(100%)
Oyun	14(28.6%)	35(71.4%)	49(100%)

The table showed that the about from Ilorin west 81.9% represents 60 respondents testified that local governments are not given adequate autonomy in Kwara State, while only 18.1% represents 14 of the respondents who agreed that the local governments are given adequate autonomy. The table also showed that in Moro it was about 15.8% represents 9 respondents that testified that local governments are not given adequate autonomy in Kwara State, while only 84.2% represents 48 of the respondents who agreed that the local governments are given adequate autonomy. Also the table showed that in Oyun it was about 75.7% represents 56 respondents that testified that local governments are not given adequate autonomy in Kwara State, while only 24.3% represents 56 of the respondents who agreed that the local governments are given adequate autonomy. Sequel to all these, it is obvious that local governments in Kwara State suffered from independence. To fully understand the data presentation, the interview conducted from all the selected local governments in Kwara State is presented to support the quantitative data collected. This is presented as follows:

The Administrative Officers in Moro Local Government Council said that: The failure of local government council to discharged healthcare services to the populace of the local communities is as a result to inadequate autonomy to recruit the local health officers to the various local health centres(Fieldwork, 2017). The Health Officer in the same local government also said that: local government council is totally crippling to recruit healthcare officers by the state due to the politics of joint account that would allowed state government to have access to the local government funds. They further explicate that the state government is taken upon itself to recruit healthcare officers and transfer them to respective communities without the consent of the local government authorities. to them, there some local health

centres that needed at least 12 Nurses, 3 Community Health Officers, 4 Doctors and even 6 Lab attendance but the state government will recruited just 2 Nurses and 1 CHO and no single Doctor (Fieldwork, 2017).

The Principal Accountants in Ilorin West Government Council said that: As entrenched in the 1989 constitution, the local government is empowered recruit the health officers without the state government interference through the establishment of local government service commission. In their respond, they stated that 1999 constitution failed to clear states that power should be given to the local government to recruit the senior health officers to the local communities. as it was said by the health officers in Moro Local Government, the Senior Nursing officers in Ilorin west local government said it is better for the local government councils to recruit health officers because the authority of the local governments know how important their people need medical care than the state government. They also cited example of the bridge that collapsed in Alagbado that if local government council is empowered financially, they will recruit and do the road that will help populace to access quick healthcare services delivery. The executive health officers in the same local government (Ilorin West) said that: the local government lack administrative capacity to recruit health officers to the local government (Fieldwork, 2017).

The Revenue Officer in Oyun Local Government council opined that: the local government is given autonomy to recruit the health officers without the state government intervention but the state government is practically and actively does the recruitment. He further explicate that the paper speaks (constitution) the right power was given to the local government but the action is contrary to the consent of the constitution. Respondent B, the Executive Officers said that the recruitment is majorly done by the state government through the state ministry of health and then deploy them to the various local health centres in the state. Another Revenue Officer II said that to her best of knowledge, *they are not empowered to carry such recruitment* (Fieldwork, 2017).

Following the presentation of the respondents in this study, it was very obvious that the Kwara State have illegally taken all the constitutional responsibilities of the local governments in terms of recruitment of both the senior and junior staff. as captured in the Nigerian observer, the local governments as organ closest to the people are supposed to provide basic services and projects to the communities at the grassroots. However, the expected impact of the state-local government relations on the people in terms of provision of healthcare services to the people are not commensurate with the statutory allocations received from the federation account. consequently, the relationship between the Kwara State and local governments in term of healthcare staffing responsible for the failure of the community healthcare centres in the selected local government as identified by the respondents and supported as well by the constitution of federal republic of Nigeria.

Stuti (2017) explained that the factor that is responsible for the failure of the local government is inability to recruit qualified health officers and the unqualified will be posted village with low level facilities and typically staffed by a junior paramedic. sequel to the examination of what the Stuti said, the interview conducted in Malete health centre supported the argument of the scholar, because for more than three I was visiting the health centre in Malete only Community Health Officer (CHO) were found treating the patients and this was caused by the residual responsibility of Kwara State to recruit the health officers through the Kwara State

Local Government Service Commission.

6.3 Binomial Logistic Regression

Table 7: Model Summary

Step	-2log Likelihood	Cox&Snell R Square	Negelkerke R Square
1	187.824 ²	.070	.098

- a) estimation terminated at iteration number 4 because of parameter estimates changed by less than .001

In order to understand how much variation in healthcare service delivery is explained by the explanatory variables, we used Cox & Snell R square and Negelkerke R square which are equivalent to R square in multiple regression analysis. The model summary above indicates that the explained variations in healthcare service delivery in Kwara State ranges between 70% and 98 %.

Table 8: Classification Table^a

Item	Predicated		Percentage Correct	
	Health service delivery			
Observed	No	Yes	%	
Power relations	No	19	31	38.0
	Yes	15	96	86.5
Overall Percentage				71.4

- a. the cut values is 0.05

Hypotheses Testing

This section focuses on testing the research hypotheses as proposed in this study. SPSS version 20, particularly correlation and regression analysis were also used to test the hypotheses.

Decision Rule: the strength of evidence in support of a null hypothesis is measured by the p-value. If the p-value is less than the significance level (0.05), the null hypothesis is rejected. However, the p-value is higher than the significance level, the null hypotheses is accepted.

Hypothesis 1: is rejected and therefore *there is no significant impact of state-local government power relations on healthcare services delivery in the selected local governments of Kwara State.*

Table 9: Variable in the Equation

	B	SE.	Wald	df	Sig.	Exp(B)	95% CI for EXP(B)	
							LOWER	UPPER
Step1 ^a Power Relations	1.367	.402	11.533	1	.001	3.923	1.782	8.633
Constant	-.569	.387	2.168	1	.141	.566	-	-

- a. variable entered on step 1: Power Relations

The table showed that the contributions of each independent variable to the model and its statistical significance. State-local government power relations are positively related to healthcare services delivery in Kwara State. The result showed that there is a significant

relationship between the two variables as showed in the table where sig (0.001) is less than 0.05. This is supported by the opinion of the respondents in the interview conducted on the state-local government power relations in the selected local governments in Kwara State. Consequently, the null hypothesis stated that there is no significant impact of state-local government power relations on healthcare services delivery in the selected local governments of Kwara State. The result of the Binomial Logistic regression test indicates 1.367 Beta value at the associated significant level of 0.001 which is less than the conventional significant level of 0.05, with Cox & snell R Square value of .070 indicating that about 0.070% of variation in power relation will be accounted for by the healthcare services delivery in the selected local government.

Decision: Hypothesis 1: is rejected and therefore there is no significant impact of state-local government power relations on healthcare services delivery in the selected local governments of Kwara State. The result of the interview conducted is analyzed below to buttress further the argument of respondents

The Interview Conducted on the Relationship between the State and the Local Governments' Power Relations

Respondent A, a Former Chairman of Ilorin West Local Government responded that: 'the State-Local Governments' relations in Kwara State are referred to as the father-children relations in which the authority to control the affairs of the local government is a residual function of the state. Secondly, the relationship between the two organs (state and the local governments) supposed to be the supervisory relations, where the state will check the excessive actions of the local governments on her citizens'. The Respondent A's remark shows that if the 1999 constitution of the country empowers a state government to hold residual power over the local government, it means that state government have legal backing to direct the affairs of the local governments of the state. However, the study showed that the capacity of the Kwara State to recruit the health staff for the local governments is misconstrue of the content of the constitution by the state government.

Respondent B, a Former Chairman of the Oyun Local Government responded that: 'the state local governments' power relations perceived as a mechanism that recognized by the 1999 Nigerian constitution to supervise the socio-political activities of the local governments but reverse is the case as the state government sees relationship as a measure to subject the local governments to administrative cabinets of the state'. **Respondent B's** remark indicated that the relationship between the state and local government is inevitable because the state government should be a mercenary of the central government to check the actions of the local governments of the state. In the analysis of this second respondent's view of the state-local government power relations, the local governments need the state government to assist them to fill the gaps in the area of internally generated revenue since some of the local governments have a very weak base for revenue generated. Well, the finding discovered that Oyun Local Government Council have very weak internally generated revenue, this means that some local governments in Kwara State are depending much on external sources of revenue generation.

Respondent C: a Staff of the Local Government Service Commission responded that: 'the State-Local Government relations could be viewed from the concept of federalism, where the three organs are recognized, such as the federal, state and the local governments. In

his expansion of the concept, the state is stronger than the local governments. And the local government depends on the state for the survival. Consequent upon this according to him, the state-local governments' relation is inevitable, since some of the local governments are very weak in terms of Internally Generated Revenue to finance their domestic affairs.

Respondents D: a Staff of The Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy Affairs responded that: 'the relationship between the two tiers of governments is a threat to the development of the local governments. In his further response, he emphasized that local governments did not enjoy autonomy all in the name of the residual power to appoint, to finance and to conduct the election of the local councils in the state as it enshrined in the sections of the Nigerian 1999 constitution.

Analysis of the respondents' views

The fourth schedule of the 1999 constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria speaks about the relationship between the state and local governments by emphasizing on the modality of the local government to carry-out the functions as follows, The consideration and the making of recommendations to a state commission on economic planning or any similar body on the economic development of the state, particularly in so far as the state are affected, and the functions of a local government council shall include participation of such council in the government of a state in respects of the following matters: the provision and maintenance of health services; and such other functions as may be conferred on a local government council by the House of Assembly of the State. Mawhood (1993), argued that the inter-tier relationship between the state-local governments as a means of sharing parts of the governmental powers by a central ruling group with other groups, each having authority within the specific area or state.

Respondents C and D evaluated the relationship between the state and local governments as a threat to the development to the local governments, this because the objective of the constitution in the fourth schedule is negated by the actions of some of the state governments, most especially the Kwara State government. it is obvious according to Lev (2008), that the establishment of the inter-tier relations is to promote the following: a) peace and harmony among the tiers of government, and to put in-place a mechanism for the achievement of self-reliant economy, natural economic integration among the levels of government, to generate co-operation and to stop the issue of rural-urban migration and poverty but reverse is the case as Kwara State government turn the local government as a source of revenue generation and political patronage to their political supporters.

To what extent would you describe the relationship between the state-local governments in Kwara State on the appointment of health officers by this commission?

Respondent A: A Director in the Local Government Service Commission responded that the local government service commission is an institution established by the state government and it comprises the state and local governments' workers. The institution is a body that saddled with responsibility to recruit, promote, and punish the senior staff of the 16 local governments of the state especially on healthcare staff'. However, he further explained that the healthcare centres in the state are just a healthcare system that gives first aid to the patients before such patients are referred to the hospital. Consequently, the Salaries of doctors and other health officers are placed on special scale i.e 50% of the local government allocation and the other allowances to the doctors are too much to bear by the local government

management. In the final analysis according to him, the state government found it difficult to appoint doctors and some of the healthcare officers to the local health centres in the local governments of the state.

Respondent B: A staff of the Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy Affairs responded that the local government failed to recruit enough doctors because of size of their salaries and other allowances, in his further explanations, he responded that about 50% of external source of revenue to the local government allotted to the health officers' salaries and allowances alone.

Analysis of the respondents' views on the recruitment of healthcare officers

The Respondents A and B responded that the reasons for the failure to deliver adequate health services to the people at the healthcare centres in the local communities are subject to the size of the revenue generation locally and the level of salaries taken by health officers. Edogbanya, & Ja'afaru (2013) defined Public revenue as the funds generated by the government to finance its activities. In other words revenue is the total fund generated by government (Federal, state, local government/ to meet their expenditure for a fiscal year. This refers also to the grand total of money of income received from the source of which expenses are incurred. In furtherance to the above analysis, the research conducted here indicated that since local government did not fully enjoy autonomy on socio-political economy, it is not clear to the people the amount realize internally or externally are not enough to recruit doctors and the other healthcare officers. However, no institution that will excel if such an institution is depending on another for its activities.

Consequently, the local governments need some financial autonomy to finance their activities effectively. Local government system in Nigeria needs a moderate amount of financial autonomy to be able to discharge its responsibilities effectively. Public revenue in a federal system assumes that there are benefits to be derived from decentralization. Public revenue decentralization occurs when lower tiers of government have statutory power to raise taxes and carry out spending activities within specified legal criteria.

Recommendations

It is very important to know that there are two approaches to explain the phenomenon. The first-one is perceiving perception which enables the researcher to engage in the study by observation and the result of the research would be non-empirical. The second-one is participating perception which enables the researcher to engage in the study and the result would be empirical. This study embraces both the observational method and Radom sampling and helps to provide the following recommendations: There should be autonomy for the local governments in Kwara State to generate revenue internally without intervention of the state according to the forth-schedule of the 1999 constitution but reverse is the case as most of the local governments in Kwara State rely much on external sources of revenue. This resulted into the inability to stand economically independent not to talk on how to improve the welfare of people. The study hereby recommends that the constitution should device a mechanism to check the activities of the local governments as regard revenue utilization and empowered them to access the external revenue generated without full participation of the state government in order to promote healthcare services delivery at the local health centre in the local communities of Kwara State.

- I. There is need to strengthening the functions of Auditor General for the local government to publish the activities of the local government as regard their expenditure and revenue monthly or yearly to enable the inhabitants of the local governments have first class knowledge about the financial capability of the local governments. If accountability is enhanced, there is every possibility that local healthcare services will be delivered at the local governments.
- ii. The study also suggests that the residual function of the state chose or to appoint the local government executives should be removed and to be handled by the federal government through the exclusive legislative lists, this will promote democratic situation of the local government. take for instance, after the expiration of the administration of the past elected local government chairmen in Kwara State, the state going by the residual power appointed care takers twice which was undemocratic process of governing. The care takers were appointed by the Godfather who happens to be an apparatus of the state and it is expected for him to accountable to the state government instead of the people. In view of this, the answer to the question of the people in respect of healthcare service delivery would not be answered.
- iii. In addition to the above, the constitution should recommend that there is continuity in the local governments the way it has been experiencing by other tiers of governments in order to promote the sustainability of the projects embarked upon by the local government cochairmen, because constant change in government result to frequent change in policy and that is why most of the local health centres are facing damages and non-completion of the buildings.

Conclusion

It is apparent that the power relations between state and local governments in Nigeria are an issue that greatly affecting the performance of the local government to discharge the services expected of the local government by the people. The constitution is not properly clarifying the functions to be performed by the local government. Power is given to the state to recruit, promote and punish the local governments' staff. The response of the respondents shows that autonomy that is not given to the local government is a threat to the performance of the local government in all ramifications.

REFERENCES

Textbooks

- Adamolekun , L.(1979). The idea of local government as the third level of government in Nigeria. Ibadan,:Heireman
- Ademolekun L. (1983) Public Administration: A Nigerian and Comparative Prospective: Longman, London pp 120, 103
- Akinsanya, A.A. (2005). Local government in Nigeria's inter-governmental relations under the 1999 constitution" in Ayoade J. (ed). Reading in Nigeria Government and Politics. Ijebu- Ode: Gratia Associates International.

- Almond, G. A., & Powell, G. 8., Jr (1966). *Comparative politics: A developmental approach*, Boston: Little, Brown.
- Bello, I.B. (2007). *The local government system in Nigeria*, Published by College Press and Publishers Ltd, Lagos University Ibadan, Nigeria.
- Dalhatu, S. (2006). *Essays on local government administration: Fostering better service delivery, record keeping, accountability and empowerment at the local government*. Kano: Benchmark Publishers
- Ekpo, A.H (1994). "Fiscal federalism: Nigeria post-independence experience", world development, a contemporary focus. Benin-City: Imprint Services
- Mark G. E. K.. (2009). *The Political Philosophy of Michel Foucault*, London, Routledge. pp. 37-38
- Mawhood, P. (1993). *Decentralization: The concept and the practice in Mawhood*, P. (ed) Local government in the third world. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons
- Robert, A. D (2016). *The concept of power*. Yale University: Department of Political Science.
- Sergin, B. (2016) M. Foucault's View on Power Relations: Institute of Philosophy and Psychology C. R. 'Motru', Bucharest
- Whereas, K.C. (1963). *Federal government* (Fourth Edition), London: Oxford University

Journals

- Adamaleku, L.(1983). *Public administration. A Nigeria and comparative perspective*. Lagos: Longman Group Ltd. Journal, September Edition Vol. 8, No. 20 ISSN: 1857-7881
- Aigbepue, S. and Ainabor, A (2011). Issues and challenges of Nigerian fiscal federalism, *Interdisciplinary Journal of Research in Business* Vol. 1, Issue. 10, (pp.26- 31) November, 2011
- Alenoghena I. Aigbiremolen A. O. Abejegah C. (2014) Primary healthcare in Nigeria: Strategies and constraints in implementation. *International Journal of Community Research*. ISSN:2315-6562
- Inyang, B. (2014). Contending issues in the management of inter-tier relations in the Nigeria federal administration system. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*. Rome-Italy: MESER Publishing.
- Iyi, E (2013). An Assessment of the Viability of Inter-tier relations in enhancing physical developments in Enugu State, Nigeria. *IOSR J. Environmental Science Toxicology. Food Technology* (IOSR-JESTFT) e ISSN 2319 – 2402, 5 (5).
- Okpata, F. O. (2005). Legal basis of local government system in Nigeria'. *African Journal of Political & Administrative Studies*. Vol.2, No.1. Okududu, S. (2007) 'The Legislature in Democracy' *African Journal of Educational Research and Management Studies* Vol.1, No.1 &

- Rondinelli, D. A (1981). Government decentralization in comparative perspective: theory and practice in developing countries. *International Review of Administrative Science*, 47(2)
- Sagay, I. (2008, May 19). How a true federal system should run". The Nation, Lagos.
- Tiamiyu, A and Deji, A. (2016). Reviewing joint state-local governments' accounts: The Pilot

Conferences

- Aigbokhan, B.O (2000). Fiscal federalism and growth in Nigeria". In *fiscal federalism and Nigeria's economic development*, Selected Papers of Nigerian Economic Society (NES Annual Conference).
- Ekpo, A.H (2004). Inter-tier fiscal relations: The Nigerian Experience. A Paper Presented at the 10th Year Anniversary of the Financial and Fiscal Commission of South Africa, Cape Town: South Africa.
- Jenifer, W. (2014). 19th Century division of powers, 21st century problems: understanding Canada intergovernmental relations: A research study conducted for policy innovation. The federal ideas on think thank federalism.
- Rondinelli, D. 1990. Decentralizing urban development programs: A framework for analyzing policy options. USAID Office of Housing.

Thesis/Seminars.

- Edogbanya, A and Ja'afaru G. S (2014). Revenue generation: It's impact on government developmental effort (A Study of Selected Local Council in Kogi East Senatorial District)
- Erunke, C.E and Usman, A.Y. (2012) State – local government Relations in Nigeria's Fourth Republic: An Assessment of the (1999-2010) Experience. European Scientific

Reports and Gazettes

- Kwara State Health Development Projects (KWSTSHDP, 2010-2015).
- Nigeria 1999 Constitution
- Business Comment of Australia, 2006
- Kwara State Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy Affairs
MLGCA/ZO/VOL.1/258, 2016